## Contents

1 Introduction to Probabilities, Graphs, and Causal Models  
  1.1 Introduction to Probability Theory ........................................... 11  
  1.1.1 Why Probabilities? .............................................................. 11  
  1.1.2 Basic concepts in probability theory ...................................... 12  
  1.1.3 Combining Predictive and Diagnostic Supports ......................... 17  
  1.1.4 Random Variables and Expectations ........................................ 18  
  1.1.5 Conditional independence and graphoids ................................. 21  
  1.2 Graphs and Probabilities ....................................................... 22  
  1.2.1 Graphical Notation and Terminology ..................................... 22  
  1.2.2 Bayesian Networks ............................................................ 23  
  1.2.3 The \( d \)-Separation Criterion ........................................... 26  
  1.2.4 Inference with Bayesian Networks ......................................... 30  
  1.3 Causal Bayesian Networks ...................................................... 31  
  1.3.1 Causal Networks as Oracles for Interventions ......................... 33  
  1.3.2 Causal Relationships and Their Stability ............................... 35  
  1.4 Functional Causal Models ....................................................... 36  
  1.4.1 Structural Equations ......................................................... 37  
  1.4.2 Probabilistic Predictions in Causal Models ............................. 40  
  1.4.3 Interventions and Causal Effects in Functional Models ................ 42  
  1.4.4 Counterfactuals in Functional Models ................................... 44  
  1.5 Causal versus Statistical Terminology ..................................... 49  

2 A Theory of Inferred Causation ................................................... 53  
  2.1 Introduction – The basic intuitions ......................................... 54  
  2.2 The Causal Discovery Framework ............................................. 56  
  2.3 Model Preference (Occam’s razor) ........................................... 57  
  2.4 Stable Distributions ............................................................... 60  
  2.5 Recovering DAG Structures ................................................... 62  
  2.6 Recovering Latent Structures ................................................ 64  
  2.7 Local Criteria for Inferring Causal Relations ............................. 66  
  2.8 Nontemporal Causation and Statistical Time .............................. 70  
  2.9 Conclusions ............................................................................ 72  
    2.9.1 On Minimality, Markov, and Stability .................................. 73
5 Causality and Structural Models in Social Science and Economics 157
5.1 Introduction ................................. 158
  5.1.1 Causality in Search of a Language ............... 158
  5.1.2 SEM: How its Meaning Became Obscured ........ 159
  5.1.3 Graphs as a Mathematical Language .......... 162
5.2 Graphs and Model Testing ....................... 164
  5.2.1 The Testable Implications of Structural Models ... 164
  5.2.2 Testing the Testable ...................... 168
  5.2.3 Model Equivalence ....................... 170
5.3 Graphs and Identifiability ..................... 174
  5.3.1 Parameter Identification in Linear Models ... 174
  5.3.2 Comparison to Nonparametric Identification ... 180
  5.3.3 Causal Effects: The Interventional Interpretation of Structural Equation Models ... 183
5.4 Some Conceptual Underpinnings ................. 185
  5.4.1 What Do Structural Parameters Really Mean? ... 185
  5.4.2 Interpretation of Effect Decomposition ... 189
  5.4.3 Exogeneity, Superexogeneity, and Other Frills ... 191
5.5 Conclusion .................................. 196
  5.5.1 An Econometric Awakening? .................. 197
  5.5.2 Identification in Linear Models ............. 198
  5.5.3 Robustness of Causal Claims ............... 198

6 SIMPSON’S PARADOX, CONFOUNDING, AND COLLAPSI-
BILITY 199
6.1 Simpson’s Paradox: An Anatomy .................. 200
  6.1.1 A Tale of a Non-Paradox .................... 200
  6.1.2 A Tale of Statistical Agony ................ 202
  6.1.3 Causality versus Exchangeability .......... 203
  6.1.4 A Paradox Resolved (Or: What Kind of Machine is Man) ... 206
6.2 Why There Is No Statistical Test For Confounding, Why Many Think There Is, and Why They Are Almost Right .......................... 209
  6.2.1 Introduction .............................. 209
  6.2.2 Causal and Associational Definitions ........ 210
6.3 How the Associational Criterion Fails ............ 211
  6.3.1 Failing Sufficiency via Marginality .......... 211
  6.3.2 Failing Sufficiency via Closed-World Assumptions ... 212
  6.3.3 Failing Necessity via Barren Proxies ........ 212
8 Imperfect Experiments: Bounding Effects and Counterfactuals  
8.1 Introduction ........................................ 288  
8.1.1 Imperfect and Indirect Experiments ............... 288  
8.1.2 Noncompliance and Intent to Treat ............... 289  
8.2 Bounding Causal Effects with Instrumental Variables ... 290  
8.2.1 Problem Formulation: Constrained Optimization ... 290  
8.2.2 Canonical Partitions: The Evolution of Finite-Response Variables ... 292  
8.2.3 Linear Programming Formulation .................. 294  
8.2.4 The Natural Bounds ................................ 296  
8.2.5 Effect of Treatment on the Treated ............... 297  
8.2.6 Example: The Effect of Cholestyramine .......... 298  
8.3 Counterfactuals and Legal Responsibility ............ 299  
8.4 A Test for Instruments .................................. 302  
8.5 A Bayesian Approach to Noncompliance ............. 304  
8.5.1 Gibbs Sampling .................................... 304  
8.5.2 The Effects of Sample Size and Prior Distribution ... 305  
8.5.3 Causal effects from clinical data with imperfect compliance ... 306  
8.5.4 Bayesian Estimate of Single-Event Causation .... 308  
8.6 Conclusion ............................................ 309  
9 Probability of Causation: Interpretation and Identification  
9.1 Introduction ........................................ 311  
9.2 Necessary and Sufficient Causes: Conditions of Identification ... 314  
9.2.1 Definitions, Notation, and Basic Relationships ... 314  
9.2.2 Bounds and Basic Relationships under Exogeneity ... 317  
9.2.3 Identifiability under Monotonicity and Exogeneity ... 319  
9.2.4 Identifiability under Monotonicity and Nonexogeneity ... 321  
9.3 Examples and Applications ............................ 323  
9.3.1 Example 1: Betting against a Fair Coin ............ 323  
9.3.2 Example 2: The Firing Squad ...................... 325  
9.3.3 Example 3: The Effect of Radiation on Leukemia ... 327  
9.3.4 Example 4: Legal Responsibility from Experimental and Nonexperimen- tial Data ............................................... 330  
9.3.5 Summary of results ................................ 331  
9.4 Identification in Nonmonotonic Models ............... 332  
9.5 Conclusions ............................................ 335  
10 The Actual Cause  
10.1 Introduction: The Insufficiency of Necessary Causation ... 338  
10.1.1 Singular Causes Revisited ...................... 338  
10.1.2 Preemption and the Role of Structural Information ... 339  
10.1.3 Over-determination and Quasi-Dependence ....... 341  
10.1.4 Mackie’s INUS Condition ....................... 342  
10.2 Production, Dependence, and Sustenance ............ 344
10.3 Causal Beams and Sustenance-Based Causation ........................................ 346
  10.3.1 Causal Beams: Definitions and Implications ................................. 346
  10.3.2 Examples: From Disjunction to General Formulas ....................... 349
  10.3.3 Beams, Preemption, and the Probability of Single-Event Causation . . 351
  10.3.4 Path-Switching Causation .................................................... 353
  10.3.5 Temporal Preemption .......................................................... 354
10.4 Conclusions ....................................................................................... 356

Epilogue: The Art and Science of Cause and Effect
(A public lecture delivered November 1996 as part of the UCLA Faculty Research Lectureship Program.) 361

11 Reflections, Elaborations, and Discussions with Readers 383
  11.1 CAUSAL, STATISTICAL, AND GRAPHICAL VOCABULARY ................. 384
      11.1.1 Is the Causal-Statistical Dichotomy Necessary? ....................... 384
      11.1.2 d-Separation without Tears (Chapter 1, pp. 16–18) ................. 388
  11.2 REVERSING STATISTICAL TIME (CHAPTER 2, pp. 58-9) .................. 391
  11.3 ESTIMATING CAUSAL EFFECTS ..................................................... 393
      11.3.1 The Intuition behind the Back-Door Criterion (Chapter 3, p. 79) . 393
      11.3.2 Demystifying “strong ignorability” ........................................ 397
      11.3.3 Alternative proof of the back-door criterion ............................ 400
      11.3.4 Data vs. knowledge in covariate selection ............................... 403
      11.3.5 Understanding Propensity Scores .......................................... 406
      11.3.6 The Intuition behind do-Calculus .......................................... 410
      11.3.7 The Validity of G-estimation ............................................ 411
  11.4 POLICY EVALUATION AND THE _do_-OPERATOR ....................... 413
      11.4.1 Identifying conditional plans (Section 4.2, p. 113) .................. 413
      11.4.2 The meaning of indirect effects ......................................... 414
      11.4.3 Can do(x) represent practical experiments? ............................ 417
      11.4.4 Is the do(x) operator universal? ....................................... 418
      11.4.5 Causation Without Manipulation!!! ...................................... 420
      11.4.6 Hunting Causes with Cartwright ....................................... 421
      11.4.7 The Illusion of Nonmodularity ....................................... 423
  11.5 Causal Analysis in Linear Structural Models ..................................... 425
      11.5.1 General criterion for parameter identification (Chapter 5, pp. 149-54) 425
      11.5.2 The causal interpretation of structural coefficients .................. 426
      11.5.3 Defending the Causal Interpretation of SEM (or, SEM Survival Kit) 429
      11.5.4 Where Is Economic Modeling Today? – Courting Causes with Heckman ........................................... 435
      11.5.5 External Variation vs. Surgery ........................................ 437
  11.6 DECISIONS AND CONFOUNDING (CHAPTER 6) ............................... 442
      11.6.1 Simpson’s paradox and decision trees ................................ 442
      11.6.2 Is Chronological Information Sufficient for Decision Trees? .......... 444
      11.6.3 Lindley on Causality, Decision Trees, and Bayesianism ........... 446